

# KDL Teen Graphic Novel Contest

## Judging Criteria Guide

When judging graphic novel entries, consider the following criteria and rate submissions based on the degree to which they're met.

### Illustration:

#### • Workmanship

- Is it clean and professional, or are there smudges, sloppy lines, etc.
- Are the illustrations clear? Is it easy to tell what's going on, who is who?
- Is the story visually easy to follow?
- Is the quality of work consistent throughout the comic?

#### • Technique

- What level of skill and/or effort is evident for their age group?
- Are characters and objects drawn accurately for their age and skills?
- Are they successfully using their chosen media?
- Is there visual depth (overlapping, line weight, sense of space). If applicable, is perspective being portrayed correctly?
- If applicable, is there an understanding of light and shadow?

#### • Page Layout

- Does the overall page and panel layout flow?
- Are the transitions easy to follow?
- How are the compositions and framing within the panels?
- Does the shape, size, and placement of panels tell you anything more about the emotion or importance of their scenes, or are they generic?

#### • Creativity

- Is the style unique and distinctive or have you seen it a lot?
- Are there interesting character designs?
- Does the background design serve as an interesting setting?

#### • Expressiveness

- How much emotion/reaction can be read from the character's facial expressions and body language? Can you tell without reading the text?

- Do the illustrations overall (characters, style, setting) evoke a certain mood? Does it match the story?

## **Story & Text:**

### ● Originality

- Have you seen this story before?
- If so, did they take a new or interesting view of it?
- Is it predictable? If there's a twist, is it thoughtful or an easy out?
- Does the story resonate or leave any impact on you?

### ● Clarity & Plot

- Is the story easy to follow? If not, does it feel like it's that way on purpose?
- How is the pacing?
- Does the plot make sense? Is there some form of resolution?
- How well does the text move the story forward?

### ● Setting & Characters

- Is the setting well established?
- How do the characters work in the setting?
- Do the characters feel genuine instead of cliché? Are they unique from each other?
- Do the characters grow?

### ● Grammar & Dialogue

- Is the grammar and spelling correct? If not, does it help or detract from the story?
- Is the dialogue appropriate for the age group?
- Is the dialogue authentic? Does it match the emotion presented in the images or author's intent?

### ● Use of Text

- If there is no text, does the story make sense? Would the story be better served by the inclusion of text elements?
- Is the text legible?
- Is the text well-placed within the art?
- Is there a balance between the text and art that serves the story well?
- Do text variations (font styles, bold/italic/underline, sound effects, etc.) make sense and help the story, or is it out of place?

## Judging Scorecard

Based on the detailed rubric, write the number that best represents the comic's fulfillment in that criteria on a scale of 0-5 with 5 being the highest.

<b>Illustration</b>		<b>Story &amp; Text</b>	
Workmanship	/ 5	Originality	/ 5
Technique	/ 5	Clarity & Plot	/ 5
Page Layout	/ 5	Setting & Characters	/ 5
Creativity	/ 5	Grammar & Dialogue	/ 5
Expressiveness	/ 5	Use of Text	/ 5
<b>Total</b>	<b>/ 25</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>/ 25</b>
<b>Overall Total</b>			<b>/50</b>