

KDL Teen Graphic Novel Contest

Judging Criteria Guide

When judging graphic novel entries, consider the following criteria and rate submissions based on the degree to which they're met.

Illustration:

• Workmanship

- Is it clean and professional, or are there smudges, sloppy lines, etc.?
- Are the illustrations clear? Is it easy to tell what's going on, who is who?
- Is the story visually easy to follow?
- Is the quality of work consistent throughout the comic?

• Technique

- What level of skill and/or effort is evident for their age group?
- Are characters and objects drawn accurately for their age and skills?
- Are they successfully using their chosen media?
- Is there visual depth (overlapping, line weight, sense of space). If applicable, is perspective being portrayed correctly?
- If applicable, is there an understanding of light and shadow?

• Page Layout

- Does the overall page and panel layout flow?
- Are the transitions easy to follow?
- How are the compositions and framing within the panels?
- Does the shape, size, and placement of panels tell you anything more about the emotion or importance of their scenes, or are they generic?

• Creativity

- Is the style unique and distinctive or have you seen it a lot?
- Are there interesting character designs?
- Does the background design serve as an interesting setting?

• Expressiveness

- How much emotion/reaction can be read from the character's facial expressions and body language? Can you tell without reading the text?

- Do the illustrations overall (characters, style, setting) evoke a certain mood? Does it match the story?

Story & Text:

● Originality

- Have you seen this story before?
- If so, did they take a new or interesting view of it?
- Is it predictable? If there's a twist, is it thoughtful?
- Does the story resonate or leave any impact on you?

● Clarity & Plot

- Is the story easy to follow? If not, does it feel like it's that way on purpose?
- How is the pacing?
- Does the plot make sense? Is there some form of resolution?
- How well does the text move the story forward?

● Setting & Characters

- Is the setting well established?
- How do the characters work in the setting?
- Do the characters feel genuine instead of cliché? Are they unique from each other?
- Do the characters grow?

● Grammar & Dialogue

- Is the grammar and spelling correct? If not, does it help or detract from the story?
- Is the dialogue appropriate for the age group?
- Is the dialogue authentic? Does it match the emotion presented in the images or author's intent?

● Use of Text

- If there is no text, does the story make sense? Would the story be better served by the inclusion of text elements?
- Is the text legible?
- Is the text well-placed within the art?
- Is there a balance between the text and art that serves the story well?
- Do text variations (font styles, bold/italic/underline, sound effects, etc.) make sense and help the story, or is it out of place?

SCORE CARD

| ILLUSTRATION | | SCORE OUT OF 5 |
|---|--|----------------|
| WORKMANSHIP <i>Cleanliness, Professionalism, Consistency</i> | | |
| TECHNIQUE <i>Effort, Accuracy, Visual Depth</i> | | |
| PAGE LAYOUT <i>Framing, Flow, Narrative Impact</i> | | |
| CREATIVITY <i>Style, Distinction, Visual Interest</i> | | |
| EXPRESSIVENESS <i>Emotion, Mood, Context</i> | | |
| TOTAL : | | /25 |
| STORY & TEXT | | SCORE OUT OF 5 |
| ORIGINALITY <i>Inventiveness, Imagination, Variety</i> | | |
| CLARITY & PLOT <i>Pacing, Purpose, Resolution</i> | | |
| SETTING & CHARACTERS <i>Authenticity, Cohesion, Development</i> | | |
| GRAMMAR & DIALOGUE <i>Structure, Precision, Accuracy</i> | | |
| USE OF TEXT (or lack thereof) <i>Balance, Variation, Coherence</i> | | |
| TOTAL : | | /25 |
| FINAL SCORING | | |
| Score out of 50 <i>Add together Total scores from Illustration and Story & Text</i> | | |
| TOTAL : | | /50 |
| Calculate total score out of 10 for Submittable <i>Divide Score out of 50 by 5 (Round up for .5 and above, round down for .4 and below)</i> | | |
| TOTAL : | | /10 |